

Classification & Compensation RFQ – 2017

35 maximum points

Rate 1 - 5	Gallagher	Heinfeld-Meech	Segal Waters	McGrath
Ariz- Pub Sector exp	5 comparable local cities (Buckeye, Gilbert, Queen Creek, Tolleson, Litchfield Park)- 5	Mostly schools, no prior class study only comp - 3	4 comparable local cities (Marana, Sierra Vista, Goodyear, Avondale)-5	No Arizona cities, 5 other cities as references - 3
Cost - Class	\$10,000 - 5	\$44,950 - 3	\$30,000 - 4	\$18,784 - 4
Cost – Comp	\$45,000 -4 Project costs: \$22,000	\$17,600 - 5	\$40,000 - 4	18,784 - 5
Classification plan	Review of pos. questionnaires & specs., ensure legally compliant, No interviews - 3	Includes interviews, no mention of ADA or internal equity. - 3	ee interviews (1-day), titles, key diffs btwn job families, FLSA - 5	ee-interviews and dept directors, PDQ's, no mention of part-time - 4
Compensation plan	Market analysis, (lag/lead,etc.)implementation options, compression assessment - 5	Fiscal impacts to city, rec for implementation, future maintenance incl.- 3	Custom, use 60 titles, market comparison by title, part-time not mentioned in the deliverables - 4	Compression issue not mentioned but have PS exp. , would assess current vs possible change to structure - 3
Policy & Procedure Review	Included in deliverables, but little detail provided- 4	Not mentioned in deliverables, nor is part-time pay schedule - 2	Assess policies, mkt comparison, draft policies in Word so we can edit - 4	Assess policies , would assist in communicating current recom. and future maintenance - 4
Deadline	5 months - 4	3 months - 5	5 months - 4	6 months -3
Comments	2-days on-site, up to 3 implementation options w/b provided, compression mitigation solutions	Minimal city experience, less familiarity with common city class & comp issues, etc.	1-day of interviews, 1 – day of on-site presentations	4 on-site visits, mentioned appeal process for ee's, phased approach for implementation.
Total Points	29 points	24 points	30 points	26 points

Z:\HR Intra Department Confidential\Class & Comp\2016 Class & Comp Survey\Scoring Matrix.docx